Evaluating Collaboration
Using Pictures and Numbers

Bruce B. Frey
Psychology and Research in Education
Jill H. Lohmeier
School Program Evaluation and Research (SPEAR)

School of Education
University of Kansas

Annual Meeting of American Evaluation Association
2004, Atlanta, GA
Evaluating Collaboration
Using Pictures and Numbers

• Safe Schools, Healthy Students Evaluation Project
• Identifying Collaboration as a Goal
• Development of Levels of Collaboration Scale
• Development of the Collaboration Map
• Communicating through Map Elements
• Collaboration Information as Formative Data
Safe Schools, Healthy Students Grant Goals

1. Maintain a safe school environment.
2. Increase protective factors and reduce risk factors.
3. Prevent onset of serious mental health, behavioral and emotional problems.
4. Provide family-focused interventions to help children enter school ready to learn.
5. Increase positive behaviors of students.
6. Create awareness and support for zero tolerance policies.
Safe Schools, Healthy Students Grant Goals

1. Maintain a safe school environment.
2. Increase protective factors and reduce risk factors.
3. Prevent onset of serious mental health, behavioral and emotional problems.
4. Provide family-focused interventions to help children enter school ready to learn.
5. Increase positive behaviors of students.
6. Create awareness and support for zero tolerance policies.
7. Increase collaboration among grant partners.
Safe Schools, Healthy Students Grant Partners

Mental Health Agency
Early Childhood Program
Parent Education Program
Police Department
School District Prevention Counselors
After School Programs
Student Improvement Teams
Alternative High School
Principals
Teachers
Grant Director
Collaboration is generally treated as meaning the cooperative way that two or more entities work together towards a shared goal.

Has been studied

- among individuals with shared goals in mental health and education (Kabler and Genshaft, 1983; Moriarty, 2000; Pugach and Johnson, 1989; Smith, Frey and Tollefson, 2003)

- within and among individuals in the development of small groups (Tuckman, 1965; Tuckman and Jensen, 1977)

## Stage Theories of Collaboration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coexistence</th>
<th>Communication</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Coordination</th>
<th>Coalition</th>
<th>Collaboration</th>
<th>Coadunation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Peterson Model (1991)**
  - 1: "Networking"
  - 2: 3
  - 4: 
  - 5: 

- **Levels of Community Linkage Model (Hogue, 1993)**
  - 1: "Networking"
  - 2: 3
  - 3: 
  - 4: "Merging"
  - 5: "Unifying"

  - 1: "Networking"
  - 2: "Partnering"
  - 3: "Merging"
  - 4: "Unifying"

- **Levels of Integration Model (Gajda, 2004)**
  - 1: "Networking"
  - 2: "Partnering"
  - 3: "Merging"
  - 4: "Unifying"

- **Seven Stage Model**
  - 1: 
  - 2: 
  - 3: 
  - 4: 
  - 5: 
  - 6: 
  - 7: 

- **Networking**
- **Partnering**
- **Merging**
- **Unifying**
## Five Levels of Collaboration

adapted from the work of Hogue (1993)
Borden and Perkins (1998, 1999)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Networking</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Coordination</th>
<th>Coalition</th>
<th>Collaboration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Aware of organization</td>
<td>- Provide information to each other</td>
<td>- Share information and resources</td>
<td>- Share ideas</td>
<td>- Members belong to one system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Loosely defined roles</td>
<td>- Somewhat defined roles</td>
<td>- Defined roles</td>
<td>- Share resources</td>
<td>- Frequent communication characterized by mutual trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Little communication</td>
<td>- Formal communication</td>
<td>- Frequent communication</td>
<td>- Frequent and prioritized communication</td>
<td>- Consensus is reached on all decisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- All decisions are made</td>
<td>- All decisions are made</td>
<td>- Some shared decision making</td>
<td>- All members have a vote in decision making</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>independently</td>
<td>independently</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Networking**
- Aware of organization
- Loosely defined roles
- Little communication
- All decisions are made independently

**Cooperation**
- Provide information to each other
- Somewhat defined roles
- Formal communication
- All decisions are made independently

**Coordination**
- Share information and resources
- Defined roles
- Frequent communication
- Some shared decision making

**Coalition**
- Share ideas
- Share resources
- Frequent and prioritized communication
- All members have a vote in decision making

**Collaboration**
- Members belong to one system
- Frequent communication characterized by mutual trust
- Consensus is reached on all decisions
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship Characteristics</th>
<th>Networking 1</th>
<th>Cooperation 2</th>
<th>Coordination 3</th>
<th>Coalition 4</th>
<th>Collaboration 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Networking</td>
<td>-Aware of organization</td>
<td>-Provide information to each other</td>
<td>-Share information and resources</td>
<td>-Share ideas</td>
<td>-Members belong to one system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Loosely defined roles</td>
<td>-Somewhat defined roles</td>
<td>-Defined roles</td>
<td>-Frequent communication</td>
<td>-Frequent communication</td>
<td>-Frequent communication is characterized by mutual trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Little communication</td>
<td>-All decisions are made independently</td>
<td>-All decisions are made independently</td>
<td>-Some shared decision making</td>
<td>-All members have a vote in decision making</td>
<td>-Consensus is reached on all decisions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Safe Schools, Healthy Students Partners</th>
<th>No Interaction at All</th>
<th>Networking</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Coordination</th>
<th>Coalition</th>
<th>Collaboration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mental Health Agency</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Childhood Programs</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Education Program</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School District Prevention Counselors</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs Director</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Improvement Teams</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principals</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police Department</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship Characteristics</td>
<td>Networking 1</td>
<td>Cooperation 2</td>
<td>Coordination 3</td>
<td>Coalition 4</td>
<td>Collaboration 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Aware of organization</td>
<td>- Provide information to each other</td>
<td>- Share information and resources</td>
<td>- Share ideas</td>
<td>- Members belong to one system</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Loosely defined roles</td>
<td>- Somewhat defined roles</td>
<td>- Defined roles</td>
<td>- Share resources</td>
<td>- Frequent and prioritized communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Little communication</td>
<td>- Formal communication</td>
<td>- Frequent communication</td>
<td>- Frequent resources</td>
<td>- All members have a vote in decision making</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- All decisions are made independently</td>
<td>- All decisions are made independently</td>
<td>- Some shared decision making</td>
<td>- Mutual trust</td>
<td>- Consensus is reached on all decisions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Baseline**
Mean = 1.50 (SD = .50)

Grant Partners Established a Collaboration Objective of 2.41

**After Year One**
Mean = 1.77 (SD = .50)

30% Progress Towards Objective
Visualizing Collaboration
Visualizing Collaboration

Visualizing Collaboration


Levels of Linkage

CSO
SRO
Consultant
Suicide Resource Center
Safe Environment Assessment Specialist
Student Family Support Team

Threat Assessment Coordinator
Visualizing Collaboration

- CSO
- Consultant
- Safe Environment Assessment Specialist
Visualizing Collaboration

CSO

Consultant

Safe Environment Assessment Specialist
Elements of the Collaboration Map Which Provide Information
Elements of the Collaboration Map Which Provide Information

Circles
Elements of the Collaboration Map Which Provide Information

Circles

Arrows
Elements of the Collaboration Map Which Provide Information

Circles

- After School Programs
  - Mean Number of Links: 6
  - Mean Level of Collaboration: 1.86

Arrows

- 

Numbers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean Number of Links</th>
<th>Mean Level of Collaboration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.08</td>
<td>1.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Elements of the Collaboration Map Which Provide Information

**Circles**
- After School Programs
  - Mean Number of Links: 6.00
  - Mean Level of Collaboration: 1.86

**Arrows**
- Mental Health Agency → Early Childhood Programs
- Early Childhood Programs → Parent Education

**Numbers**
- Mental Health Agency
  - Mean Number of Links: 10.00
  - Mean Level of Collaboration: 2.14

**Relative Spacing**
- After School Programs
- Mental Health Agency
- Early Childhood Programs
- Parent Education
Collaboration Between Safe Schools, Healthy Students Partners - November, 2002

--- Key ---
Level 0  None               No line
Level 1  Networking     No line
Level 2  Cooperation   
Level 3  Coordination   
Level 4  Coalition       
Level 5  Collaboration  
Number of links determines size of circle.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Mean Number of Links</th>
<th>Mean Level of Collaboration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mental Health Agency</td>
<td>5.08</td>
<td>1.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Childhood Programs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Counselors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principals</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Director</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Service Agency</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Counselors</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Counselors</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Counselors</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Counselors</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Counselors</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Counselors</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Counselors</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After School Programs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>